

COMPLETE OUTLINE OF THE HURLEY DECISION by the CMCFA

- I. [Summary of the] Application before the Board—pp. 1-3
 - A. Overview of the parties' positions—pp. 3-6
 - 1. For the grievor—pp. 3-4
 - 2. For the employer—pp. 4-5
 - 3. For the bargaining agent—pp. 5-6
- II. Issues—pp. 6-7
- III. Summary of evidence—pp. 7-17
 - A. Background facts not in dispute with respect to the MOA—pp. 8-13
 - 1. Pay administration—annual salary increments—pp. 8-9
 - 2. The MOA—pp. 10-13
 - B. Undisputed facts—pp. 14-16
 - 1. Sabbaticals—pp. 14-16
 - 2. Course relief—pp. 16-17
- IV. The *Burchill* objection—p. 17
 - A. The parties' evidence with respect to the April 2015 meeting—pp. 17-19
 - 1. Overview—p. 17
 - 2. Dr. Hurley—p. 17
 - 3. Dr. Noel—p. 18
 - 4. Dr. Kowal—pp. 18-19
 - 5. Dr. Bates—p. 19
 - B. Evidence with respect to drafting the grievance—pp. 19-22
 - C. The grievance process—pp. 22-42
 - 1. The first-level hearing—p. 22
 - a) *Dr. Bates*—pp. 23-25
 - b) *Dr. Luu*—p. 25
 - 2. The second-level hearing—pp. 25-
 - a) *Dr. Luu*—p. 25
 - b) *Ms. Hau*—p. 26
 - 3. The third-level hearing—p. 35
 - a) *Dr. Luu*—p. 35
 - b) *Ms. Bing*—p. 36
 - 4. The referral to adjudication and subsequent events—p. 42

- D. Summary of the *Burchill* arguments—pp. 44-57
 - 1. For the bargaining agent—pp. 44-49
 - What was discussed at the Step #1 meeting?*—p. 47
 - What was discussed at the Step #2 meeting?*—p. 48
 - What was discussed at the Step #3 meeting?*—p. 48
 - 2. For the employer—pp. 49-57
 - Review of the evidence of the April 2015 meeting*—p. 50
 - The grievance*—p. 50
 - a) *The first-level hearing*—p. 51
 - b) *The second-level hearing*—p. 51
 - c) *The third-level hearing*—p. 53
 - d) *After the referral to adjudication*—p. 53
 - Case law: the Burchill principle*—p. 55
- [The Board's] Analysis re the *Burchill* Objection—pp. 57-61
 - 1. Applying the jurisprudence to the facts—pp. 58-61
- V. Is the grievance moot insofar as it relates to the MOA?—pp. 61-65
 - [The Board's] Analysis on the Mootness Issues—pp. 63-65
- VI. Are the MOA and Course Relief incorporated into the collective agreement as past practices under the terms of article 8?—p. 65
 - Evidence of past practice with respect to the MOA and Course Relief—pp. 65-73
 - The bargaining agent's arguments re past practice—pp. 73-77
 - The employer's arguments re past practice—pp. 77-82
 - [The Board's] Analysis re the Past Practice Issue—pp. 82-93
- Is the grievance premature?—pp. 93-96
 - The evidence—pp. 93-95
 - Argument of the bargaining agent—p. 95
 - Argument of the employer—p. 95
 - [The Board's] Analysis—pp. 95-96
- VII. Order